The Thompson TDA Model

Text Dependent Analysis – Close Reading Lessons for *Justice For All* by Lynn Rymarz

Grade 5 Comprehension and Analysis of Individual's Actions, Thoughts, Words and Main Idea

For students to successfully respond to text dependent analysis prompts, students should engage in close reading lessons. Close reading involves the use of a collection of evidence-based comprehension strategies embedded in a teacher-guided discussion, planned around repeated readings of a text to increase student comprehension. Close reading will often lead students to discover something important that may have been overlooked the first time they read the text. Throughout a close reading, teachers can use text dependent questions to promote discussion and help students to better understand the nuances of what they are reading. They can be used to start student discussions and give students opportunities to discuss the text with each other and voice their ideas. Successful analysis requires a study of the text in which students are able to analyze over and over again. The **Pennsylvania Academic Standards for English Language Arts** require moving instruction away from generic questions, to questions that require students to analyze what they are reading. This will help to ensure that students are college and career ready.

Considerations for the Grade 5 Close Reading Lessons

The Text Dependent Analysis (TDA) close reading lessons are designed to be an example pathway for teaching comprehension and analysis of the reading elements **individual's actions, thoughts, and words** and **main idea**. The Instructional Plan guides teachers through the planning and teaching of each lesson, as well as modeling the response to a grade-appropriate analysis question.

The following instructional pathway focuses on the text *Justice For All*. The lessons are only one possible instructional pathway, and teachers should feel free to modify it to meet the sequence of their curriculum, accommodate content previously taught, or to meet their current students' needs. Teachers may include additional modifications if needed.

The lessons make the assumption that students may have been exposed to text dependent analysis prompts, the definition of analysis, and the deconstruction of prompts prior to reading the text. The close reading lessons incorporate some of these expectations; however, teachers may include additional modifications if needed.

Text Dependent Analysis Information

Text	*Justice For All* by Lynn Rymarz
Complexity (Lexile and Qualitative analysis)	Lexile level: 900 (Grade 5; 770 L – 980 L) Qualitative level: Moderately low
Reading Elements/Structure for analysis	Individual's Actions, Thoughts, Words and Main idea
Reading Standards	CC.1.2.5.A: Determine two or more main ideas in a text and explain how they are supported by key details; summarize the text. CC.1.2.5.B: Cite textual evidence by quoting accurately from the text to explain what the text says explicitly and make inferences. CC.1.2.5.C: Explain the relationships or interactions between two or more individuals, events, ideas, or concepts in a text based on specific information in the text.
Writing Standards	CC.1.4.5.B: Identify and introduce the topic clearly. CC.1.4.5.C: Develop the topic with facts, definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples related to the topic; include illustrations and multimedia when useful to aiding comprehension. CC.1.4.5.D: Group related information logically linking ideas within and across categories of information using words, phrases, and clauses; provide a concluding statement or section; include formatting when useful to aiding comprehension. CC.1.4.5.E: Write with an awareness of style. Use precise language and domain-specific vocabulary to inform about or explain the topic. Use sentences of varying length.

CC.1.4.5.F: Demonstrate a grade-appropriate command of the conventions of standard English grammar, usage, capitalization, punctuation, and spelling.

CC.1.4.5.S: Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research, applying grade-level reading standards for literature and informational texts.

Instructional Text Dependent Analysis Question

*In the text, **Justice For All**, Ida B. Wells takes action against what she knows is wrong when she refuses to give up her seat on the train. Write an essay analyzing how the author uses Ida B. Wells' actions, thoughts, and words to support the main idea: never give up on something you strongly believe in. Use text evidence to support your response.*

Purpose and Use of the Instructional Plan

It is important to understand that at the beginning of fifth grade, students are 10 years old and are still practicing the ability to transfer oral analysis responses to written analysis responses. The purpose of this Instructional Plan is to provide an example of how to organize close reading lessons that will lead students to understand the components of text dependent analysis (*reading comprehension, analysis, and essay writing*).

In this plan the teacher models for students how to identify accurate evidence (*key details*), how to make an inference about the evidence, and what it means relative to the main idea. The close reading lessons are intended to guide instruction and not to grade or score student work.

The Instructional Plan is structured with the following three questions in mind:
- What are the **planned activities** and **text dependent questions** used to engage students in the targeted learning?
- What are the **teacher actions** for each of the activities?
- What are the **student actions** for each of the activities?

Each task is numbered and contains three parts:
- Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions
- Teacher Actions
- Student Actions

It is imperative to read the entire task to understand the structure of the Learning Plan and the interaction of the three parts. Each part of the task guides the teacher throughout the planning and teaching of the lessons.

<div style="background-color:green; color:white; text-align:center; font-weight:bold;">

The Learning Plan

</div>

Task #1

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:
- In this task the teacher will activate prior knowledge of explicit evidence and inferencing, and key vocabulary terms.

Teacher Actions:
- Distribute the following picture to small groups of students and/or display it:

- Explain the meaning of explicit evidence as, information or details that are directly found in a text such as quotations, paraphrases, and descriptions. Ask students to examine the picture and discuss what they explicitly see in the picture. (*Examples: woman being pulled by the arm, a man pulling the woman's arm, a passenger sitting with her arms crossed, scowls on faces, one African American woman, white people, etc.*). Have one person from each group share their evidence and record student ideas on the left-hand column of a two-column chart labeled *explicit evidence*.

- Explain the meaning of inference as, using the text evidence and their background knowledge to explain the meaning of the evidence. In small groups, ask students to make inferences based on the explicit evidence. (*Examples: the lady with her arms crossed is angry, the man pulling the woman's arm is a train conductor, the train conductor wants to take her off the train, the clothing is from a long time ago, etc*.). Have one person from each group share their inferences and record student ideas on the right-hand column of a two-column chart labeled *inferences*.
- Prompt a discussion about the illustration and what is occurring, having students make a connection about events or individuals in history (*e.g., Rosa Parks or Harriet Tubman*). Finish the discussion with definitions of injustice (*unfairness or undeserved outcomes. The term may be applied in reference to a particular event or situation, or to a larger status quo*) and equality/inequality (*all individuals within society have equal rights, liberties, and status, possibly including civil rights, freedom of expression, autonomy, and equal access to certain public goods and social services*).

Student Actions:
- As a whole class or in small groups, students identify explicit evidence and inferences about the evidence using a picture.
- Student group leaders share the evidence and inferences identified by their group.
- Students engage in a whole group discussion about injustice, equality, and inequality related to race and women using their background knowledge.

Task #2

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:
- In this task the teacher will introduce and deconstruct the TDA prompt for the text *Justice For All.*

Note: See TDA Series: The Anatomy of a Text Dependent Analysis (TDA) Prompt

- The teacher explains the meaning of analysis (*detailed examination of the elements or structure of text, by breaking it into its component parts to uncover relationships in order to draw a conclusion*).

Note: An analysis shows how two parts of the text are related to each other. A close reading examines the characteristics of the text looking for their meaning and relationship to one another supported with explicit evidence and inferences.

Teacher Actions:

- Display the TDA prompt: *In the text,* **Justice For All***, Ida B. Wells takes action against what she knows is wrong when she refuses to give up her seat on the train. Write an essay analyzing how the author uses Ida B. Wells' actions, thoughts, and words to support the main idea: never give up on something you strongly believe in. Use text evidence to support your response.*
- Read aloud or choral read the TDA prompt with students and ask students to turn-and-talk to determine the purpose of the three statements in the prompt. Have several students share their responses.

Note: Additional support should be provided depending on how often students have engaged in deconstructing a TDA prompt.

- Explain the meaning of the first statement which identifies the name of the text and the individual they will encounter in the text.
- Explain the meaning of the second statement as the action that they will engage in, *Write an essay analyzing how the author uses Ida B. Wells' actions, thoughts, and words to support the main idea; never give up on something you strongly believe in.*
- Direct students to the meaning of "analysis" (*an interrelationship of two reading elements*). If previously used, examine a *Reading Element Anchor Chart* for discussion. This chart should be displayed or can be created and displayed in the classroom and distributed to students for use during this discussion. Model for students how to locate the element that is explicitly stated first statement (individual's actions, thoughts, and words) and engage students in locating the second reading element, also explicitly stated (*main idea*).
- Engage students in a discussion of how an individual's actions, thoughts, and words could help them determine the main idea of a text.
- Explain the meaning of the third statement, identifying that they will use explicit evidence, such as quotes from the text.
- Explain that changing the second statement of the prompt into a question will help students be sure that they are answering the prompt, rather than summarizing it. Discuss what the statement is asking them to do. Ask students to identify question words *(who, what, when, where, how, why)*. In small groups of three or four, have students use question words to try to restate the prompt in a question and record the question on a sentence strip or chart paper. For example, *How does the individual's actions, thoughts, and words support a main idea that you should never give up on something you strongly believe in?*
- Display the questions and have students read each of the questions determining similarities and differences between them. Note if there are any questions that do not capture the expectation of the prompt and redirect students to creating a question from the second statement.

Student Actions:

- Students follow along as the text dependent analysis prompt is read.
- Students turn and talk to discuss the meaning of each statement in the prompt, and then share their thinking.

- Students use a *Reading Element Anchor Chart* to determine the two reading elements they will be analyzing.
- Students engage in discussing how the two reading elements are interrelated.
- In small groups, students change the second statement of the prompt into a question and record it on a sentence strip.
- Students review all of the questions noting similarities and differences.

Task #3

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:
- In this task the teacher will introduce the text, *Justice For All,* by modeling reading and annotating the text for key details.
- Text dependent questions related to different sections of the text will be posed to ensure comprehension.
- The teacher will ensure student understanding of explicit evidence, inference, and interrelationship of key details and main idea. Understanding and demonstrating this information is a prerequisite for students to be able to analyze the text.

Teacher Actions:
- Distribute the text, *Justice For All,* and read the heading information. Point out that although this is an informational text, it does not include headings or subheadings.
- Model by reading the first three paragraphs while annotating the text focusing on making inferences about the individual's actions, thoughts, and words and justice. For example:

Text	Annotations
One day in May 1884, twenty-one-year-old Ida Bell Wells boarded a train bound for Woodstock, Tennessee, and the school where she taught. Ida sat in the first-class ladies' coach[1] and opened her book. Minutes later the conductor collected passengers' tickets.	I'm surprised she is so young.
"Can't take your ticket here," the conductor told Ida. "You will have to go to the other car."	I wonder why she isn't allowed to be in the train car.
In 1884, African Americans, particularly in the South, did not have the same rights as whites. They could not attend the same schools or drink from the same water fountains. African Americans were expected to sit in a separate railroad car, one that was usually dirty and smoke-filled, though they were charged full fare.[2]	Oh, this explains why. This is so unfair for Ida and others!

- Discuss the annotations pointing out that these are reactions and inferences about what is explicitly stated in the text. Ensure student understanding of "inference" as using the text evidence and their background knowledge to explain the meaning of the evidence. Ask students if there are other annotations they would make for this section of the text related to Ida B. Wells or the concept of justice.
- Explain that students will work in a collaborative group for a second close read to respond to text dependent comprehension questions. questions supporting Remind students to use their annotations to support their responses. Provide each student with a responsibility for their collaborative discussion such as reader (reads the identified section of the text), questioner (reads the text dependent question and ensures that the question is answered), recorder (writes the group's response on the question form), timekeeper (keeps the group moving along).

Note: See TDA Series – Collaborative Discussions for Close Reading

Note: See TDA Series – Close Reading Questions Leading to Text Dependent Analysis

- Provide students with an organizer with text dependent questions such as:

Question	Location (paragraph number)	Evidence	Inference
Why did the conductor tell Ida B. Wells that she had to go into the other car?			
What does the author mean by saying, "African Americans, particularly in the South, did not have the same rights as whites"? How does this relate to the conductor's comment in paragraph 2?			
What words does the author use to show the reader Ida's reaction (**actions, thoughts, words**) to being told to leave the first-class section? What does this tell you about her?			
What evidence does the author give that shows how the other people on the train felt about the way Ida was treated?			
What evidence does the author use to show what Ida B. Wells' life was like?			
In what way has Ida's childhood influenced her actions, thoughts, and words when on the train? Why do you think this?			
What did Ida B. Wells do (**actions**) to try and fight for justice?			

How did Ida B. Wells react (**thoughts, words, and actions**) when she lost her lawsuit against the railroad?			
Even though slavery ended after the Civil War, that doesn't mean that everyone still had equal rights. What are some examples from the article that show everyone didn't have the same rights?			
What evidence does the author use to show us that Ida B. wasn't willing to give up her fight (**actions**)?			
Even after her death, Ida B. Wells helped make a difference. Find a piece of text evidence to support this statement.			

- Model recording a response to the first question, such as:

Question	Location (paragraph number)	Evidence	Inference
Why did the conductor tell Ida B. Wells that she had to go into the other car?	Paragraph 3	"In 1884, African Americans, particularly in the South, did not have the same rights as whites."	There was still injustice and prejudice against African Americans

- As a whole group, discuss the comprehension questions ensuring that students select accurate and precise evidence and demonstrate an appropriate inference about the evidence.

Student Actions:
- Students reread and annotate the text and discuss their annotations related to Ida B. Wells or the concept of justice with the whole group.
- In a collaborative group, students respond to text dependent questions by identifying the location of the evidence, the evidence that answers the question, and an inference about the evidence.
- Students discuss the responses to the questions with the whole group.

Task #4

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:
- In this task the teacher will support students in understanding *main idea* of the entire text using the key details.

Teacher Actions:

- Display the phrase *main idea* and ask students to turn and talk to define or explain the meaning of main idea. Define main idea as, the most important thought or statement about the topic. Explain that a text can have more than one main idea, but it must be supported with key details.

Note: If students have engaged in determining the author's message/theme from narrative texts, this instruction can be used to help them understand identifying a main idea statement about the entire informational text.

- Have students reread the first six paragraphs of the text and to review their responses to the text dependent questions. In pairs, ask students to brainstorm a key idea or the most important thing the author wants the reader to remember from this section (*e.g., people of color were treated unfairly in the 1800s)*. As students share the key ideas, ensure they provide evidence from the text to support their thinking. Record these ideas on chart paper and discuss the strengths and weaknesses of each. Help students to eliminate those that are not supported by text evidence.
- Repeat this process for paragraphs 7-10, 11-15, 16-19.
- Using the statements from each of the sections, explain that they will create one or two main idea statements that supports the entire text and the topic of justice or equality.
- In triads or groups of four, have students brainstorm a possible main idea about the entire informational text by posing the question: *What is the author trying to tell the reader about justice or equality?* Have students record their statement on a sentence strip or on chart paper.
- Display the main idea statements and ask students to read each statement. Discuss the similarities and differences of each statement, as well as whether the statement is specific to one section or captures what the entire text is about. A possible main idea is *never give up on something you strongly believe in.*
- Identify the main idea statements that capture what the entire text is about and remind students that there are different possible ways that the main idea can be stated.

Student Actions:

- Students reread the sections of the text and responses to text dependent questions to one key idea for each section of the text.
- Students collaboratively identify a main idea of the entire text using the key ideas of each section while responding to the question: *What is the author trying to tell the reader about justice or equality?*
- Students review the main idea statements and determine the ones that capture what the entire text is about.

Task #5

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:
- In this task the teacher will model using an Evidence-Inference-Interrelationship organizer in preparation for responding to the text dependent analysis prompt.
- The teacher will ensure student understanding of explicit evidence, inference, and interrelationship of key details and main idea. Understanding and demonstrating this information is a prerequisite for students to be able to analyze the text.

Teacher Actions:
- Display the TDA prompt: *In the text, **Justice For All**, Ida B. Wells takes action against what she knows is wrong when she refuses to give up her seat on the train. Write an essay analyzing how the author uses Ida B. Wells' actions, thoughts, and words to support the main idea: never give up on something you strongly believe in. Use text evidence to support your response.* And the question previously identified: *How does the individual's actions, thoughts, and words support a main idea that you should never give up on something you strongly believe in?*
- Review the TDA prompt and question ensuring understanding of the reading elements (individual – Ida B. Wells and the main idea - n*ever give up on something you strongly believe in*) to be analyzed in the text. Point out that the prompt/question provides students with a main idea. Discuss how this main idea is similar and different to the main ideas the students generated.
- Display an Evidence-Inference-Interrelationship organizer and distribute a copy to students. For example:

Main Idea: *never give up on something you strongly believe in*		
Evidence #1	Inference #1	Analysis #1
Evidence #2	Inference #2	Analysis #2
Evidence #3	Inference #3	Analysis #3

- Explain that all the previous work completed will help them to complete the organizer and write their response. Model by rereading paragraphs 4-6 and revisiting the annotations and responses to the text dependent questions to identify actions, thoughts or words of Ida B. Wells that supports the main idea. For example, while thinking aloud, record the evidence on the organizer: *Ida refused to budge...Rather than ride in the smoking car, Ida got off the train"*

- Ask students to make an inference about the evidence posing the question, "*What does this evidence show or tell us?*" For example, *This shows how strongly Ida felt about her right to sit in the first class since she purchased a ticket for this section.* Model while thinking aloud how to record the inference on the organizer. Remind students of the meaning of inferences, as needed.
- Ask students to explain how the evidence and inference about the individual is interrelated to the main idea (*analysis*) by posing the question, *What does this evidence and inference mean about the central idea?* For example, *This means that someone pays for a service, they should stand up for their right to have the service regardless of the color of their skin.* Model while thinking aloud how to record the analysis on the organizer.

Note: As students learn how to find evidence, make inferences, and state what it means, the teacher gradually releases them to work independently.

- As appropriate, either model while thinking aloud, or have students work collaboratively to complete a second and third Evidence-Inference-Interrelationship row of the organizer. If students work collaboratively, circulate as students work ensuring understanding of evidence, inference, and interrelationship.
- Students should be encouraged to use their annotations and the text dependent question/answer organizer to support locating evidence and making inferences. They should also be encouraged to use sentence starters such as, *This show… and This means.*

Student Actions:
- Students follow along and contribute to completing the first section of the Evidence-Inference-Interrelationship organizer.
- Students collaborate with peers or the teacher to complete the second and third sections of the Evidence-Inference-Interrelationship organizer.

Task #6

Planned Activities/Text Dependent Questions:
- In this task, the teacher will prepare students to write an essay drawing evidence from an informational text to support analysis applying grade-level standards. In fifth grade compositional writing should include:
    - Introduction of the main idea and concluding statement or section
    - Multiple paragraphs with one idea per paragraph or one paragraph with multiple ideas
    - Specific details and evidence from the sources of information
    - Inference about the evidence
    - Explanation of what the evidence and inference mean
    - Elaboration showing an interrelationship

- The teacher will model writing the response to the TDA prompt. Before teaching this lesson, the teacher writes a short complete response that coincides with the current group of students' learning regarding writing multi-paragraph responses. Beginning-of-year students may need only a one-paragraph example with introductory, evidence, inference, analysis, and conclusion statements. Middle or end-of-year students may need instruction using an introductory, multiple body, and conclusion paragraphs.
- The teacher will collect student responses to determine strengths and needs with respect to the ability to demonstrate the underlying components of a text dependent analysis prompt (reading comprehension, analysis, and essay writing). The Text Dependent Analysis (TDA) Learning Progressions will assist the teacher in determining next instructional steps.

Note: Students should understand the difference between the expectations of an essay and a short answer question.

Note: Fifth grade students often start with one paragraph and progress to multiple paragraphs by the end of the year.

Note: An analysis shows how two parts of the text are related to each other. In this case how the individual's actions, thoughts, and words show the main idea.

Teacher Actions:
- Ask students to brainstorm what needs to be included in an essay response to the prompt by using probing questions. Record their ideas on chart paper. Probing questions may include:
  - How could you begin your essay?
  - What can an introductory statement or section include?
  - Should you include the title and author of the story?
  - Can the introduction include a summary? Why or why not?
  - Should you include the reading elements you are going to analyze?
  - How could you end your essay?
  - Should you restate the reading elements?
  - Should you include a summary?
  - What else do you want the reader to know?
- Using the brainstormed information that was generated about the introductory paragraph and recorded on chart paper, explain that the introduction should provide enough information to help the reader know what the following paragraphs are about.
- Model writing an introductory paragraph that includes the title of the text, a restatement of the prompt with a one sentence summary, reference to the two reading elements, and identification of the main idea. If necessary, review with students how to create a 1or 2 sentence summary by having them turn and talk to identify 1 or 2 points that are most important for understanding the text. Students should record these points and time should be provided for students to share and discuss their merit.

Example introductory paragraph: *In the passage, **Justice for All**, Ida B. Wells stands up for what she believes in. Ida B. Wells was an African American who was an early leader in the Civil Rights Movement who worked hard for equality. Her actions of refusing to leave her seat and get off the train, suing the Chesapeake and Ohio Railroad, and having others follow in her footsteps is what led to the main idea, never give up on something you strongly believe in.*

- Ask students to discuss how the first body paragraph could be written. Model and think aloud, the information that should be included:
    - Topic sentence as a general statement (*e.g., Ida B. Wells was a determined individual.*)
    - Evidence
    - Inference (*This shows…*)
    - Analysis (*This means…*)
- Model, while thinking aloud, writing the first body paragraph using the Evidence-Inference-Interrelationship organizer, annotations, and the question/answer chart. For example:
In paragraphs 4 and 6 the author stated, "Having paid for a first-class ticket, Ida refused to budge...rather than ride in the smoking car, Ida got off the train." This action shows how strongly Ida felt about her right to sit in the first-class section since that is where her ticket was for. This means that when people pay the same price for a service as someone else, they are paying for the same rights as well regardless of the color of their skin. This first action begins to show how Ida B. began standing up for what she believed in.
- Depending on the strengths and needs of the students, as well as the time of the year, model writing, with student engagement, a second body paragraph or have students work in small groups to write a second body paragraph using the information from the organizer. Similarly, and depending on the strengths and needs of the students, model writing, with student engagement, a third body paragraph or have students work in pairs or triads to write a third body paragraph using the information from the organizer. Circulate ensuring that students have recorded all three parts of the response. Provide feedback on strengths and needs.
- Model while thinking aloud how to write a concluding paragraph that includes: paraphrase of the summary showing the individual's actions, thoughts, and words, and paraphrase of how the individual's actions, thoughts, and words support the main idea. For example:
In conclusion, Ida kept on fighting even after the case was appealed and overturned. This proves that she had an incredible amount of passion for equality. By refusing to give up her seat, filing a lawsuit, and inspiring generations to come Ida was able to stand up for what she believed in.

Student Actions:
- Students brainstorm what information should be included in the essay response to the TDA prompt.
- Students follow along with the teacher modeling of an introductory, body, and concluding paragraph in response to the TDA prompt.
- Students contribute to the writing of a second and third body paragraph in response to the TDA prompt.

Many thanks to Penn-Trafford Grade 5 teachers for their contributions to this instructional plan.